



Proceedings of the Meeting of the Leeds City Council held  
at the Civic Hall, Leeds on Wednesday 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2005

**PRESENT:** The Lord Mayor Councillor William Schofield Hyde in the Chair

**WARD**

**ADEL & WHARFEDALE**

Barry John Anderson  
John Leslie Carter  
Clive Fox

**ALWOODLEY**

Ronald David Feldman  
Ruth Feldman  
Peter Mervyn Harrand

**ARDSLEY & ROBIN HOOD**

Karen Renshaw

Lisa Mulherin

**ARMLEY**

Alison Natalie Kay Lowe  
James McKenna  
Janet Harper

**BEESTON & HOLBECK**

Angela Gabriel  
Adam Ogilvie  
David Congreve

**BRAMLEY & STANNINGLEY**

Angela Denise Atkinson  
Ted Hanley  
Neil Taggart

**BURMANTOFTS & RICHMOND HILL**

Ralph Pryke  
Richard Brett  
David Hollingsworth

**WARD**

**CALVERLEY & FARSLEY**

Andrew Carter  
Amanda Lesley Carter  
Frank Robinson

**CHAPEL ALLERTON**

Sharon Hamilton  
Mohammed Rafique  
Jane Dowson

**CITY & HUNSLET**

Elizabeth Nash

Mohammed Iqbal

**CROSSGATES & WHINMOOR**

Suzi Armitage  
Pauleen Grahame  
Peter John Gruen

**FARNLEY & WORTLEY**

David Blackburn  
Ann Blackburn  
Claire Nash

**GARFORTH & SWILLINGTON**

Andrea Harrison  
Mark Russell Phillips  
Thomas Murray

**GIPTON & HAREHILLS**

Alan Leonard Taylor  
Javaid Akhtar  
Roger Harington

**GUISELEY & RAWDON**

Graham Latty  
Stuart Andrew  
John Bale

**HAREWOOD**

Ann Castle  
Rachael Procter  
Alec Shelbrooke

**HEADINGLEY**

David Morton  
  
Martin Hamilton

**HORSFORTH**

Christopher Townsley  
Brian Cleasby  
Andrew Barker

**HYDE PARK & WOODHOUSE**

Penny Ewens  
Kabeer Hussain  
Linda Valerie Rhodes-Clayton

**KILLINGBECK & SEACROFT**

Graham Hyde  
Michael James Davey  
Brian Michael Selby

**KIPPAX & METHLEY**

John Keith Parker  
James Lewis  
Keith Ivor Wakefield

**KIRKSTALL**

Elizabeth M Minkin  
John Anthony Illingworth  
Bernard Peter Atha

**MIDDLETON PARK**

Geoffrey Driver  
Judith Blake  
Stuart Bruce

**MOORTOWN**

Mark Daniel Harris  
Brenda Lancaster  
Richard Harker

**MORLEY NORTH**

Robert Finnigan  
Stewart McArdle  
Thomas Leadley

**MORLEY SOUTH**

Judith Elliott  
  
Gareth Edward Beevers

**OTLEY & YEADON**

Grahame Peter Kirkland  
Colin Campbell  
Richard Downes

**PUDSEY**

Josephine Patricia Jarosz  
Richard Alwyn Lewis  
Mick Coulson

**ROTHWELL**

Donald Michael Wilson  
Steve Smith  
Mitchell Galdas

**ROUNDHAY**

Matthew Lobley  
Valerie Kendall  
Paul Wadsworth

**TEMPLE NEWSAM**

David Schofield  
Michael Lyons

**WEETWOOD**

Brian David Timothy Jennings  
Susan Bentley  
Barry Stewart Golton

**WETHERBY**

Gerald Wilkinson  
Andrew Millard  
John Michael Procter

### 13 Minutes of Council

It was moved by Councillor J Procter seconded by Councillor Gruen and

**RESOLVED** – That the minutes of the Special Council meeting held on 20<sup>th</sup> May 2005 and of the Annual Council Meeting held on 23<sup>rd</sup> May 2005 be approved

### 14 Declarations of Interest

The Lord Mayor announced that a list of written declarations submitted by members was on display in the ante-room, on deposit in the public galleries and had been circulated to each member's place in the Chamber.

Following an invitation to declare further individual interests, declarations in accordance with the Council's Code of Conduct were made as follows:

- (a) Councillor Gabriel declared a personal and prejudicial interest in minute 30 as an employee of a Mental Health Trust and a personal interest in minute 23 as her son was a member of the Morley Rugby Football Union Club who appeared in the game at Twickenham
- (b) Councillor Smith declared a personal and prejudicial interest in minute 30 as a non executive director of a PCT
- (c) Councillor Wakefield declared a personal and prejudicial interest in minute 30 as a non executive director of a PCT
- (d) Councillor Ogilvie declared a personal and prejudicial interest in minute 30 as a non executive director of a PCT
- (e) Councillor Kirkland declared a personal interest in minute 7 of the Executive Board as a Foundation Governor of Prince Henry's Grammar School
- (f) Councillor Wilson declared a personal interest in relevant minutes of the Executive Board as a governor at Haigh Road Infants School, Rothwell and Rothwell Primary School
- (g) Councillor Galdas declared a personal interest in relevant minutes of the Executive Board as a governor at Woodlesford Junior School
- (h) Councillor Leadley declared a personal interest in minute 18 as the occupier of premises which has a public right of way within the curtilage
- (i) Councillor McKenna declared a personal interest in minute 25 as a part time employee of Armley Helping Hands and minute 30 as a member of Leeds West PCT

- (j) Councillor C Nash declared a personal and prejudicial interest in minute 26 due to her husband's financial and personal interests in road charging schemes referred to and also a possible interest in investments in new railway stations
- (k) Councillor Harper declared a personal interest in minute 30 as a non executive director of a PCT
- (l) Councillor Lowe declared a personal interest in minute 25 as the paid Chief Officer for Touchstone Leeds, a Mental Health Charity

## 15 Communications

The Chief Executive reported the resignation from the office of Councillor on 21<sup>st</sup> June 2005 of Gregory Mulholland for the Headingley Ward and that a by election in respect of this vacancy would be held on 28<sup>th</sup> July 2005 and the notice of poll would be no later than 23<sup>rd</sup> June 2005

## 16 Deputations

Three deputations were admitted to the meeting and addressed Council as follows:

- 1 Scholes Residents Regarding Inadequate Local Bus Services
- 2 The Campaign Committee Against the Closure of Fir Tree Primary School
- 3 Parents and Governors Against the Proposed Closure of Miles Hill Primary School

**RESOLVED** – That the subject matter of each of the three deputations be referred to the Executive Board for consideration

## 17 Reports

Reports admitted to the agenda in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 2.2(f) were considered as follows:

- (a) Scrutiny Boards' Annual Report to Council 2004/05

It was moved by Councillor J Procter seconded by Councillor M Hamilton and

**RESOLVED** – That the Scrutiny Boards' Annual Report to Council prepared in accordance with Article 6 of the Constitution be received

- (b) Appointments

It was moved by Councillor J Procter seconded by Councillor P Gruen and

**RESOLVED** - That the report of the Director of Legal and Democratic Services on appointments by Council be approved.

## 18 Questions

- 1 Councillor Selby to the Executive Member (Neighbourhoods and Housing)

Will the Executive Member responsible advise Council of the work carried out, the resources budgeted and the number of staff employed to implement the right of way closures approved by the Government prior to June 2004 under the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000.

The Executive Member (Neighbourhoods and Housing) replied

- 2 Councillor Campbell to the Leader of Council

Would the Leader of Council care to comment on the grass cutting contract?

The Leader of Council replied

- 3 Councillor Anderson to the Executive Member (Development)

Will the Executive Board Member for Development tell me how much the Chancellor's new stealth tax on Stamp Duty affecting land sales is likely to cost the local authority over the next 12 months

The Executive Member (Development) replied

- 4 Councillor Gruen to the Executive Member (Leisure)

Could the Executive Board member for leisure please update council on the current position in relation to Whinmoor cemetery?

The Executive Member (Leisure) replied

- 5 Councillor Downes to the Executive Member (Central and Corporate)

Will the Executive Member for Corporate Services tell me what the new administration is doing to promote equal opportunities in the city?

The Executive Member (Central and Corporate) replied

- 6 Councillor Lobley to the Executive Member (Development)

Will the Executive Board Member responsible for Development update me on the progress of the Private Street Works programme

The Executive Member (Development) replied

- 7 Councillor Murray to the Executive Member (Learning)

Could the Executive Board member for learning please inform Council how many staff in the Council's adult learning centres such as TechNorth and the South Leeds Learning Centre are dedicated to

finding employment or training opportunities for local people and assisting with 'closing the gap' in the city?

The Executive Member (Learning) replied

8 Councillor Cleasby to the Executive Member (Development)

Why does the fountain in City Square not work and how much did the previous Labour administration spend on the fountain?

The Executive Member (Development) replied

9 Councillor Iqbal to the Executive Member (Leisure)

Will the Executive Board member for leisure confirm to council that older people are not being forced to pay more for leisure centre services since the new administration came to power?

The Executive Member (Leisure) replied

(Under the Provisions of Council Procedure Rule 22.1 it was moved by Councillor Gruen and seconded by Councillor G Hyde

That Council Procedure Rule 11.1(a) be suspended in order to extend Question Time to allow that answers be given to all questions.

Upon being put to the vote the motion was lost.

On the requisition of Councillors Gruen and G Hyde the voting on the motion was recorded as follows:

## **YES**

Armitage, Atha, Atkinson, Beevers, Blake, Bruce, Congreve, Coulson, M Davey, Dowson, Driver, Elliott, Finnigan, Gabriel, Grahame, Gruen, S Hamilton, Hanley, Harington, Harper, Harrison, G Hyde, Illingworth, Iqbal, Jarosz, Leadley, J Lewis, R Lewis, Lowe, Lyons, McKenna, Minkin, Mulherin, Murray, E Nash, Ogilvie, Parker, Rafique, Renshaw, Selby, Taggart, Wakefield

**42**

## **NO**

Akhtar, Anderson, Andrew, Bale, Barker, Bentley, A Blackburn, D Blackburn, Brett, Campbell, A Carter, J L Carter, Mrs A Carter, Castle, Cleasby, Downes, Elliott, Ewens, Mrs R Feldman, R D Feldman, Fox, Galdas, Golton, M Hamilton, Harker, Harrand, Harris, Hollingsworth, Hussain, Jennings, Kendall, Kirkland, Lancaster, Latty, Lobley, McArdle, Millard, Morton, C Nash, Phillips, J Procter, Pryke, Rhodes-Clayton, Robinson, Schofield, Shelbrooke, Smith, Taylor, Townsley, Wadsworth, Wilkinson, Wilson

**52**

At the conclusion of Question Time the following remained unanswered and it was noted that under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 11.6 written responses would be sent to each member of Council:

- 10 Councillor Atha to the Executive Member (Leisure)
- 11 Councillor Selby to the Executive Member (Neighbourhoods and Housing)
- 12 Councillor Pryke to the Executive Member (Learning)

**19 Recommendations in Accordance with Council Procedure Rule 2.2(h)**

It was moved by Councillor M Harris seconded by Councillor A Carter and

**RESOLVED** – That the Council Plan be approved in accordance with the recommendations of the Executive Board and the report of the Chief Executive now submitted

**20 Recommendations in Accordance with Council Procedure Rule 2.2(k)**

It was moved by Councillor Harris seconded by Councillor A Carter and

**RESOLVED** - That the recommendations of the Corporate Governance and Audit Committee as detailed in the report of the Director of Legal and Democratic Services be approved

**21 Minutes**

It was moved by Councillor Harris seconded by Councillor J Procter and

**RESOLVED** – That the minutes submitted to Council in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 2.2(l) be received

(Council Procedure Rule 4 providing for the winding up of business was applied prior to all notified comments on the minutes having been debated)

(The meeting was suspended at 5.35 pm and resumed at 6.00 pm)

**22 Suspension of Council Procedure Rules**

It was moved by Councillor J Procter seconded by Councillor M Hamilton and

**RESOLVED** – That under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 22.1, Procedure Rule 12.3(b) be suspended to allow the two White Paper motions in the name of Councillor Grayshon to be proceeded with in his absence and in the absence of written authority for them to be taken up by some other member.

**23 White Paper Motion – Morley RUFC**

It was moved by Councillor Finnigan seconded by Councillor Beevers and

**RESOLVED UNANIMOUSLY** - That this Council send its congratulations to Morley Rugby Football Union Club following their victorious match against Westoe at Twickenham and we hope that their success continues.

**24 White Paper Motion – VE Day and VJ Day**

It was moved by Councillor Elliott seconded by Councillor Leadley and

**RESOLVED UNANIMOUSLY** - That this Council sends grateful appreciation on the occasion of the 60<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of VE Day and VJ Day to the people of Leeds, and further afield, who served in the Second World War. We also send our grateful thanks to those who serve in the armed forces in current day conflicts.

**25 White Paper Motion – Provision of Social Services**

It was moved by Councillor Harrand seconded by Councillor Harris and

**RESOLVED** – That Council deplores the regular scare-mongering and misinformation of some opposition councillors about the provision of Social Services and requests all Elected Members who comment on the subject to stick to the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth

**26 White Paper Motion – Road Pricing and Traffic Congestion**

It was moved by Councillor Harris seconded by Councillor A Carter

That Council notes with concern Government proposals to introduce further trial schemes for road pricing based on untried satellite technology. Council believes that pricing people off the roads in any single area may have a detrimental effect on local economies, providing disincentives to economic investment and failing to tackle the root causes of pollution and congestion.

Council reiterates its view that the best way to combat road congestion in Leeds is by the introduction of improved public transport including the Supertram system, additional guided bus and quality bus schemes, and investment in new railway stations. Council further notes that plans for all the above have been ready for several years, but that central Government has prevaricated over their development

Council believes that the best way to tackle road congestion is to provide reliable and efficient public transport, thus providing an acceptable alternative to the private car, and particularly regrets that central Government has failed to make a firm decision to go ahead with Leeds Supertram over the past fifteen years. Council therefore requests that the Executive Board call for a report on the Government's proposals and their potential implications

An amendment was moved by Councillor Lyons seconded by Councillor J Lewis

Delete all after "Council" and replace with:



“believes that vastly improved public transport is necessary before any form of road user charging is considered for Leeds.”

The amendment was lost and upon the motion being put to the vote it was:

**RESOLVED** – That Council notes with concern Government proposals to introduce further trial schemes for road pricing based on untried satellite technology. Council believes that pricing people off the roads in any single area may have a detrimental effect on local economies, providing disincentives to economic investment and failing to tackle the root causes of pollution and congestion.

Council reiterates its view that the best way to combat road congestion in Leeds is by the introduction of improved public transport including the Supertram system, additional guided bus and quality bus schemes, and investment in new railway stations. Council further notes that plans for all the above have been ready for several years, but that central Government has prevaricated over their development

Council believes that the best way to tackle road congestion is to provide reliable and efficient public transport, thus providing an acceptable alternative to the private car, and particularly regrets that central Government has failed to make a firm decision to go ahead with Leeds Supertram over the past fifteen years. Council therefore requests that the Executive Board call for a report on the Government’s proposals and their potential implications

On the requisition of Councillors Gruen and Driver the voting on the amendment was recorded as follows:

## **YES**

Armitage, Atha, Atkinson, Beevers, Blake, Bruce, Congreve, Coulson, M Davey, Dowson, Driver, Elliott, Finnigan, Gabriel, Grahame, Gruen, S Hamilton, Hanley, Harington, Harper, Harrison, G Hyde, Illingworth, Iqbal, Jarosz, Leadley, J Lewis, R Lewis, Lowe, Lyons, McArdle, McKenna, Minkin, Mulherin, Murray, E Nash, Ogilvie, Parker, Rafique, Renshaw, Selby, Taggart, Wakefield

**43**

## **NO**

Akhtar, Anderson, Andrew, Bale, Barker, Bentley, A Blackburn, D Blackburn, Brett, Campbell, A Carter, J L Carter, Mrs A Carter, Castle, Cleasby, Downes, Ewens, Mrs R Feldman, R D Feldman, Galdas, Golton, M Hamilton, Harker, Harrand, Harris, Hollingsworth, Hussain, Jennings, Kendall, Kirkland, Lancaster, Latty, Lobley, Millard, Morton, Phillips, J Procter, Pryke, Rhodes-Clayton, Robinson, Schofield, Shelbrooke, Smith, Taylor, Townsley, Wadsworth, Wilkinson, Wilson

**48**

On the requisition of Councillors J Procter and J L Carter the voting on the motion was recorded as follows:

## **YES**

Akhtar, Anderson, Andrew, Bale, Barker, Bentley, A Blackburn, D Blackburn, Brett, Campbell, A Carter, J L Carter, Mrs A Carter, Castle, Cleasby, Downes, Ewens, Mrs R Feldman, R D Feldman, Galdas, Golton, M Hamilton, Harker, Harrand, Harris, Hollingsworth, Hussain, Jennings, Kendall, Kirkland, Lancaster, Latty, Lobley, Millard, Morton, Phillips, J Procter, Pryke, Rhodes-Clayton, Robinson, Schofield, Shelbrooke, Smith, Taylor, Townsley, Wadsworth, Wilkinson, Wilson

**48**

## **NO**

Armitage, Atha, Atkinson, Blake, Bruce, Congreve, Coulson, M Davey, Dowson, Driver, Gabriel, Grahame, Gruen, S Hamilton, Hanley, Harington, Harper, Harrison, G Hyde, Illingworth, Iqbal, Jarosz, J Lewis, R Lewis, Lowe, Lyons, McKenna, Minkin, Mulherin, Murray, E Nash, Ogilvie, Parker, Rafique, Renshaw, Selby, Taggart, Wakefield

**38**

## **ABSTAIN**

Beevers, Elliott, Finnigan, Leadley, McArdle

**5**

### **27 White Paper Motion – Grass Cutting Service**

It was moved by Councillor Wakefield seconded by Councillor Lowe

That this Council condemns the ruling administration for their mismanagement of the grass cutting service and calls on those Executive Members responsible for the fiasco to resign.

An amendment was moved by Councillor Finnigan seconded by Councillor Elliott

Delete all after 'That' and replace with:

"This Council, noting the significant problems with the grass cutting service under both public and private provision, requests the Executive Board to delegate the grass cutting service and associated funding to Town and Parish Councils or if none exist to Area Committees at the earliest possible opportunity. This Council believes that localising this service will support and promote local businesses and local employment opportunities and will provide a better grass cutting service."

Upon being put to the vote both the amendment and the motion were declared lost

On the requisition of Councillors Finnigan and Leadley the voting on the amendment was as follows:

**YES**

Beevers, Elliott, Finnigan, Leadley

4

**NO**

Akhtar, Anderson, Andrew, Armitage, Atha, Atkinson, Bale, Barker, Bentley, A Blackburn, D Blackburn, Blake, Brett, Bruce, Campbell, A Carter, J L Carter, Mrs A Carter, Castle, Cleasby, Congreve, Coulson, M Davey, Downes, Dowson, Driver, Ewens, Mrs R Feldman, R D Feldman, Fox, Gabriel, Galdas, Golton, Grahame, Gruen, M Hamilton, S Hamilton, Hanley, Harington, Harker, Harper, Harrand, Harris, Harrison, Hollingsworth, Hussain, G Hyde, Illingworth, Iqbal, Jarosz, Jennings, Kendall, Kirkland, Lancaster, Latty, J Lewis, R Lewis, Lobley, Lowe, Lyons, McArdle, McKenna, Millard, Minkin, Morton, Mulherin, Murray, C Nash, E Nash, Ogilvie, Parker, Phillips, J Procter, Pryke, Rafique, Renshaw, Rhodes-Clayton, Robinson, Schofield, Selby, Shelbrooke, Smith, Taggart, Taylor, Townsley, Wadsworth, Wakefield, Wilkinson, Wilson

89

**28 Suspension of Council Procedure Rule**

During the debate under minute 27 above it was moved by Councillor J Procter seconded by Councillor M Hamilton and

**RESOLVED** – That under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 22.1, Procedure Rule 3.2 be suspended to allow all White Paper Motions to be debated

**29 White Paper Motion – Poverty in Africa**

It was moved by Councillor Harington seconded by Councillor Gruen and

**RESOLVED UNANIMOUSLY** - That this Councils supports the Government's attempts, supported by all political parties to eradicate poverty in Africa. Council welcomes the campaigns run by a number of non-governmental organisations and church groups in Leeds and agrees that the Leader of the Council should be asked to consider what support the Council can give to local groups who wish to support the campaign

**30 White Paper Motion – Fire Safety Standards within Leeds Mental Health Trust PFI**

Under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 14.9 consent of Council was given for Councillor Finnigan to alter the motion in his name so as to include wording to the same effect as the amendment in the name of Councillor Harrand.

Under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 14.10 consent of the seconder and of Council was given for Councillor Lowe to withdraw the amendment in her name

Under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 14.10 consent of the seconder and of Council was given for Councillor Harrand to formally withdraw his amendment following its acceptance into the motion

It was moved by Councillor Finnigan seconded by Councillor Elliott and

**RESOLVED UNANIMOUSLY** – That this Council, noting concerns raised at fire safety standards within Leeds Mental Health Trust PFI buildings invites the Overview and Scrutiny Committee to arrange an inquiry into these issues and further calls on the Department of Health to hold a full public inquiry into failures by the Trust to implement the highest fire safety standards possible.

(Council rose at 9.50 pm)