Report of the Chief Planning Officer

PLANS PANEL CITY CENTRE

Date: 10th September 2009

Subject: APPLICATION 09/02430/FU – DEMOLITION OF PILOT PLANT BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION OF NEW 4 STOREY RESEARCH LABORATORY BUILDING WITH OFFICE ACCOMMODATION AT REAR OF THE HOULDSWORTH BUILDING UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS, WOODHOUSE LANE AND CLARENDON ROAD, WOODHOUSE, LS2.

APPLICANT

University of Leeds

DATE VALID

7/7/09

TARGET DATE

6/10/09

Electoral Wards Affected:

Hyde Park and Woodhouse

Ward Members consulted (referred to in report)

Specific Implications For:

Equality and Diversity

Community Cohesion

Narrowing the Gap

RECOMMENDATION: DEFER and DELEGATE approval to the Chief Planning officer subject to the conditions specified (and any others which he might consider appropriate) and the completion of a legal agreement within 3 months from the date of resolution unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Chief Planning Officer, to include the following obligations:

- Public Transport contribution of 26,486
- Travel Plan with monitoring fee of £2,500.
- Two replacement bus shelters on Clarendon Road at a total cost of £20,000.
- Agreement to contribute £20,000 if there is any detrimental impact on surrounding communities from the loss of car parking (to span a 10 year period).
- Commitment to use reasonable endeavours to cooperate with LCC Jobs and Skills Service during and post construction regarding employment at the site and use local contractors, sub-contractors and material suppliers.
- £600 monitoring fee for each clause that requires admin/management/monitoring (public transport contribution, off site parking contribution).

1. Standard Time Limit
2. Samples of surfacing materials to be submitted and full details of off site works.
3. Sample panel of all external materials to be approved.
4. Full details of hard surfacing to be submitted (including details and implementation of amendments to footpaths, parking and access road).
5. Full Details of cycle and motor cycle parking facilities to include improvements to the existing motorcycle store at the Houldsworth Building.
6. Details of any lighting, vents, external plant, gas bottle stores, brise soleil and all other excrescences on the sides or roof of the building.
7. Confirmation of site levels and building heights.
8. Noise attenuation measures for future occupiers to be agreed.
9. Details of construction management measures including contractors’ cabins and parking, location of site hoardings to protect passing pedestrians.
11. Details of drainage works including sustainable drainage techniques to be provided.
13. Requirement to meet BREEAM very good.
14. Details of storage and disposal of litter.
15. Provision of shower facilities.

The following are non standard conditions, a further explanatory note regarding these conditions can be found in the Appendix – 5, 6, 15.

**Reasons for approval:** The application is considered to comply with policies GP5, GP11, GP12, BD2, BD4, BD5, T2, T5, T6, A4, SA9, SP8, CC4, CC27, S1, N12, N13 and N19 of the UDP Review, as well as guidance contained within PPS1, ‘General Policies and Guidance’ and PPG13 ‘Transport’ and, having regard to all other material considerations.

1.0 **INTRODUCTION:**
Members will recall a pre-application presentation regarding this proposal from the 20th May 2009 Panel. At this meeting Members received a presentation from the architects and provided comment on the scheme. A summary of Members' comments is provided in section 5.0 below. Following this pre-application presentation amendments have been made to the scheme to attempt to address Members comments and a formal application has been submitted which is now brought to Members with a request they resolve to grant permission and defer and delegate the final decision to the Chief Planning Officer.

2.0 **PROPOSAL:**
A four storey Energy Research building is proposed on the site of the demolished red brick building, the facilities within the building will be part of the Faculty of Engineering which is located in this northern part of the campus. The building will provide energy research facilities in several key areas including alternative energy systems, aviation, hydrogen and energy from biomass.

The building has a similar footprint to the existing but with a slight increase in to both the south and east. This slight increase in footprint results in the loss of 6 parking spaces but the retention of 1 disabled parking space.

The building has a central atrium space that splits office accommodation to the south and laboratories to the north. Bridges across the atrium link the two elements. There are four levels of office accommodation in the southern wing with laboratories in the northern wing, the fifth level continues with office accommodation in the south but a large plant room in the northern wing. There are two flues that extend out of the northern roof and an element of plant on the roof of the southern wing.
The main entrance is into the atrium from Cemetery Road. The paving outside this entrance and adjacent to the south western elevation of the building will be replaced.

There are gas and fuel stores plus a long stay cycle store and short stay cycle stands attached to the east of the building at ground floor either side of the secondary entrance.

A new bin store is to be created within the existing service yard to the Houldsworth Building immediately adjacent to the proposed Energy Research Building. This will provide sufficient storage for the proposed building and the existing provision serving the Houldsworth Building. At present bin storage is spread across the service yard therefore a new mesh enclosure will help reduce the number of separate storage locations and therefore assist in tidying up the service yard.

Bronze metallic cladding panels encase the building and all stair cores whilst the central atrium will be glazed to provide natural light to both offices and laboratories. The lowest level of the south elevation is in full height glazing behind a slim colonnade. Flat roof, single storey gas stores and cycle stores to the ground floor of the eastern elevation are finished in both red brick and a metal mesh. Brise soleil are added to the recessed windows of the south and south west elevations.

Improvements are made to Cemetery Road to enhance the pedestrian access through this part of the campus. These improvements include the widening of the footpath adjacent to the gates to St George’s Field and the removal of a parking space to allow the footway to be widened and a raised platform crossing be introduced across Cemetery Road in front of the main entrance to the new building.

The application has been supported by the following documents:
- Desk Study and Intrusive Geotechnical and Environmental Site Investigation Report.
- Travel Plan.
- Design and Access Statement that incorporates a number of appendices providing a conservation area appraisal, daylight and sunlight assessment, foul sewerage and sustainable drainage assessment, heritage statement, lighting assessment, noise impact assessment, parking and access assessment, transport statement, utilities statement and a ventilation and extraction statement.
- Sustainability Statement.

The following planning obligations are to be included within the Section 106 agreement:
- Public Transport contribution of 26,486
- Travel Plan with monitoring fee of £2,500.
- Agreement to contribute £20,000 if there is any detrimental impact on surrounding communities from the loss of car parking (to span a 10 year period).
- Commitment to use reasonable endeavours to cooperate with LCC Jobs and Skills Service during and post construction regarding employment at the site and use local contractors, sub-contractors and material suppliers.
- £600 monitoring fee for each clause that requires admin/management/monitoring (public transport contribution, off site parking contribution).
Metro have also requested the S106 include the provision for two replacement bus shelters on Clarendon Road at a total cost of £20,000. This request is currently being disputed by the University and Members will be updated verbally at the Panel meeting.

3.0 SITE AND SURROUNDINGS:
The proposal seeks to replace the existing Pilot Plant and Foundry building adjoined to the rear of the Houldsworth Building that fronts both Clarendon Road and Woodhouse Lane at the northern end of the campus. The application site is located on Cemetery Road, the access road off Clarendon Road, and currently contains a 2/3 storey flat roof red brick building of no architectural merit.

The area around the existing building provides service access to the Houldsworth Building, some parking and pedestrian access into the campus.

St George’s Field is located to the west with the grade II listed wall and gates adjacent to the site to the southwest.

The application site is adjacent to the boundary of the University Precinct Conservation Area that extends up to the wall enclosing St George’s Field.

Cemetery Road is not an adopted highway.

4.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY:
None.

5.0 HISTORY OF NEGOTIATIONS:
The Universities Strategic Development Framework was under discussion for many months culminating in revision C being produced in May 2008. Pre-application discussions regarding this site briefly took place in 2007 whilst discussions on the current proposals commenced in April 2009.

A pre-application presentation was made to Members in May 2009 when the following comments were made:

- There was general support for the proposals with the exception of one Member’s concern regarding the minimalist design and ‘prison’ appearance and the dark materials. Notwithstanding this objection, the general support was followed with queries regarding the detailed design.

- Further clarity will be required on the exact colour of the cladding and how it weathers plus the detailed design of the brise soleil and what material this will be.

- There was a query as to whether the additional cladding material to the stair tower etc made the building look too fussy and it was felt this should be removed.

- It was felt there were no serious issues regarding the setting of the adjacent listed buildings or character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

- Cemetery Road was considered an important pedestrian route and not just a vehicular and servicing area. Members felt better pedestrian access should be provided to the building to make the area safer and more attractive. It was accepted that the route becomes more industrial after passing the gates to St George’s Field.
6.0  **PUBLIC/LOCAL RESPONSE:**
Site notices were posted 9/7/09 and an advert was placed in the Leeds Weekly News on 23/7/09. No representations from the public have been made.

7.0  **CONSULTATIONS RESPONSES:**

**Statutory:**

**Highways:** Pedestrian access improvements should also be sought from Woodhouse Lane. Cycle parking is required in accordance with the UDP. The changes to Cemetery Road will improve the street. Vehicle tracking is required for service vehicles. The development will result in the loss of some limited parking, as has been requested elsewhere across the campus, agreement to contribute £20,000 should be sought to overcome any parking problems that arise in the surrounding areas as a result of university parking being reduced/displaced, or if the university does not building the multi-storey car park.

*Response* – The pedestrian access from Woodhouse Lane is a secondary access between buildings and was not identified for improvement in the Strategic Development Framework and is not considered necessary in addition to the improvements to Cemetery Road. Cycle parking is provided at an appropriate level. Vehicle tracking drawings have been provided and are acceptable. The Section 106 will include a clause highlighting the need to contribute £20,000 if parking problems occur.

**Mains Drainage:** The proposed redevelopment would not significantly change the surface water drainage arrangements and is therefore acceptable. However, a reduction in surface water run-off should be sought. Standard conditions requested.

**Yorkshire Water:** A water supply can be provided, further observations are not required.

**Non-statutory:**

**Travelwise:** The Travel Plan is acceptable and should be included in the S106 with a monitoring fee of £2,500. The cycle store should have a solid enclosure and cycle parking should be provided at the southern entrance. Motorcycle parking is required.

*Response* – The cycle store has been amended and will be finished in brick. Within the locked bike store there will also be Sheffield stands to secure bikes to for extra security.

It is not considered necessary to add further short stay cycle parking to the southern entrance as most of the people using this building are full time employees or research students that will spend much of the day at the building. As such, visitors will be aware of the short stay (covered) spaces at the secondary entrance and this is considered sufficient.

Motorcycle parking is currently available within an enclosed mesh store at the rear of the Houldsworth Building. The proposed building would require one motorcycle parking space. Rather than seeking the introduction of a further motorcycle facility, it is considered that the existing motorcycle store can be upgraded to ensure this facility can meet the needs of those working in the new building. This requirement will be conditioned.

**West Yorkshire Archaeological Advisory Service (WYAAS):** There are no apparent significant archaeological implications attached to the proposed development.

**Streetscene Services:** The refuse collection arrangements are acceptable.
Metro: There are several bus services that would serve this development. It is advised that two of the bus stops to the north of the site on Clarendon Road are upgraded to cantilevered shelters at a cost of £10,000 each to the developer. 

Response – This issue is under discussion and further information will be presented verbally. The University dispute the need to upgrade the bus shelters as a consequence of this development.

Public Transport Contribution: The proposal will generate a significant number of trips and a contribution of £26,486 is required.

Land Contamination: No significant contamination was encountered during the site investigation and the end use has a low vulnerability therefore no objection, standard conditions recommended.

8.0 PLANNING POLICIES:
UDP: The site is within the Education Quarter and adjacent to the Woodhouse Lane/University Precinct Conservation Area.
GP5: Proposals should resolve detailed planning considerations.
GP11, GP12 (Sustainable Design).
BD2: New buildings should complement and enhance existing skylines, vistas and landmarks.
BD4: Seeks to minimise impact of plant and machinery.
BD5: Seeks to ensure a satisfactory level of amenity for occupants and surroundings.
T2: Development proposals should not create new, or exacerbate existing, highway problems.
T5: Satisfactory provision for pedestrians and cyclists.
T6: Satisfactory disabled access.
A4: Development and refurbishment proposals should be designed to secure a safe and secure environment, including proper consideration of access arrangements.
SA9, SP8: Promote development of City Centre role and status.
CC27: Proposal areas within the City Centre.
S1: The role of the CC as the regional centre will be promoted.
N12: Fundamental priorities for urban form.
N13: Requires all new buildings to be of high quality and have regard to character and appearance of surroundings.
N19: Development within or adjoining Conservation Areas should preserve/enhance the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

National Planning Guidance
PPS1 General Policies and Principles
PPG13 Transport

9.0 MAIN ISSUES
i. Principle of the proposed development.
iii. Highways.
iv. Sustainability.
v. Section 106.

10.0 APPRAISAL
i. Principle of the proposed development.
The proposed four storey building replaces the recently demolished red brick building and will provide new and improved facilities for the Faculty of Engineering. The proposed building will provide energy research facilities in several key areas and provide the University with a state of the art facility that will allow it to improve its research techniques and raise the national and international profile of the University and research it undertakes. The location of this university facility within the main city centre campus is wholly compliant with the areas designation as an ‘Education Quarter’.

The proposed building has a similar footprint to the demolished building and height to reflect the nearby Houldsworth Building and other University buildings of around 4 and 5 storeys in height. As such the basic scale and footprint of the proposal is considered to respect its surroundings and avoid any overdominance of the adjacent Conservation Area and listed wall and gates.

The surrounding area contains building of a largely modernist classical architecture of the 1960s and includes both red brick and stone buildings with regular and simple forms and window patterns, flat roofs and some low rise extensions. As highlighted above, the general scale and massing of the proposed building reflects the existing buildings whilst the detailed design and appearance of the proposal is considered to respect the simple forms of the existing whilst providing a building of contemporary appearance that will enhance the character of the area and reputation of the Faculty of Engineering.

The proposal is clad in a single material as requested at the pre-application presentation to Members. Samples and precedent images of the bronze metallic cladding will be made available to members at the panel meeting. The proposed finish is considered to maintain the simplicity of the surrounding structures whilst still providing interest and a suitable quiet backdrop to the greenspace and listed structure at St George’s Field.

Due to the split form of the building with the labs in the northern wing and offices to the south, a large glazed entrance and atrium space introduces a clean break in the two elements and provides an interesting entrance to the building. To the left (northern) side of this main entrance will be full height glazing part of the first simulator room that is intended to provide interest to this elevation by highlighting the large flight simulator that will be located in this room. At the opposite side of the entrance full height glazing extends throughout the offices at ground floor toward the eastern elevation in the service yard and therefore provides some interest to the pedestrian routes along Cemetery Road that are currently blank and lacking in interest and signs of activity.

The ground floor rainscreen panels are recessed behind the main façade with a colonnade being created at the ground floor southern elevation. The colonnade is almost 4m in height and 3m in depth and therefore will not be a low dark space but will provide cover to pedestrians and interest to the building without being oppressive.

The eastern elevation of the building is wholly contained within the service yard of the Houldsworth Building and in addition to providing a secondary entrance will also accommodate single storey store rooms for gas bottles, waste solvent, general waste and cycles etc. These stores will be finished in brick with the exception of the gas bottle store that will be enclosed by a mesh (as with the other bottle stores within the service yard of the Houldsworth Building). The roof to the gas bottle
store will be extended to provide cover to the short stay cycle parking area. The roofs to all the single storey structures will incorporate a ‘green’ roof.

The windows to the upper floors have deep reveals, incorporate brise soleil and some fritting to the glass and will therefore introduce some shadowing to the windows from both the reveals and brise soleil and further interest with the small elements of fritting. The brise soleil is in aluminium with curved blades, some detailed drawings have been provided that appear to show a neat finish and point of fixing but full details of the final design and fixing points will be required by condition. The detailed drawings also highlight how the cladding neatly returns under the colonnade through the soffit and how a cap is placed on the parapet to ensure an appropriate return.

The plant room associated with the labs is incorporated within the building with the exception of two flue pipes that extend out of the north eastern part of the roof. The height of these pipes has been kept to a minimum and they have been located in the least visually prominent part of the roof. Due to the split nature of the building separate plant machinery serves the office element. The required machinery has been located on the roof to the offices and includes air handling units and chiller units. Whereas it is not ideal for this plant to be located on the roof, the plant will be screened from view from street level by the parapet of close to 2m high. There will be some limited views from the top of the Houldsworth Building and the University has agreed to locate the plant in the least visible location and provide screening where necessary (this will be conditioned).

The proposed building has been designed to meet the strict requirements of the end user whilst still respecting the scale and form of the adjacent buildings and setting of the historic structures. The detailed design shows deep window reveals and neat finishes throughout the building and interesting but simple approach to the materials. With the addition of standard conditions regarding the finer detail and quality of materials the design and appearance of the proposed building is considered acceptable.

iii. Highways.
The proposal will result in a small number of parking spaces being lost. Due to the limited number of spaces lost, it is not considered that this will have any adverse impact on the surrounding highway network or create and parking problems in the nearby residential areas. However, in keeping with the general approach elsewhere at the University, agreement to contribute £20,000 to mitigate against any detrimental impact created by the loss of these spaces will be sought to provide for any traffic regulation orders required.

Tracking diagrams show the building can be serviced appropriately and will not impact on the servicing of the adjacent buildings.

Short and long stay cycle parking is provided at an appropriate level and whereas the short stay parking would ideally be located at the main entrance, its location at the secondary entrance allows the short stay spaces to be covered and are therefore considered acceptable. The building will be primarily used by full time staff or research students and not ad hoc visitors therefore it is considered that those using the building will be well aware of the covered facilities at the secondary entrance.

Motorcycle parking for the existing building in this part of the campus is accommodated in the cage at the rear of the Houldsworth Building. The proposed
development would require one motorcycle parking space and it is appropriate to provide this in the existing secure cage where there is scope for further motorcycle parking to be accommodated. The University has committed to upgrading this cage as part of this development and details of the upgrade, expected to be in the form of improved locks and other security measures, will be required by condition.

The improvements to Cemetery Road will enhance the experience for pedestrians in this area by clearly defining the parking area by widening part of the footway and also introducing a crossing point to the main entrance. The scale of these improvements are considered to respect the scale of development and needs of the area therefore further improvements have not been sought.

A Travel Plan has been provided and will be attached to the Section 106.

iv. Sustainability.
A sustainability statement has been provided and the University is committed to meet a target of BREEAM ‘very good’ for this building and details have been provided regarding how this is to be achieved plus information regarding a Site Waste Management Plan intended to reduce waste during construction. The sustainability measures provided to date are considered suitable for a building of this nature and, considering the use, such targets are welcomed. Further details of the sustainability measures and assurances regarding targets are required by condition to ensure the aspirations of both the University and the Council’s Sustainability Officer.

v. Section 106
The Section 106 will cover the following:
- Public Transport contribution of 26,486
- Travel Plan with monitoring fee of £2,500.
- Agreement to contribute £20,000 if there is any detrimental impact on surrounding communities from the loss of car parking (to span a 10 year period).
- Commitment to use reasonable endeavours to cooperate with LCC Jobs and Skills Service during and post construction regarding employment at the site and use local contractors, sub-contractors and material suppliers.
- £600 monitoring fee for each clause that requires admin/management/monitoring (public transport contribution, off site parking contribution).

Metro have also requested the development delivers two replacement bus shelters on Clarendon Road at a total cost of £20,000. The University disputes the need for this requirement therefore an update will be provided verbally at Panel.

11.0 CONCLUSION
The proposed building is considered to be of an appropriate scale and form to respect the character of the surrounding area and also provide an interesting building that will promote the high profile research being undertaken within the building. The proposal is not expected to create any highway safety or parking issues and will enhance pedestrian routes in the area. The sustainability measures for this highly energy intensive building are welcomed and delivery of these targets will be examined further by condition. For the reasons outlined above the proposal is considered acceptable and is recommended for approval with the attached conditions.

Background Papers:
Certificate of Ownership signed by the agent on behalf of the applicant.
APPENDIX 1

Planning Application 09/02430/FU Non Standard Conditions

5. Full details of the design of the long and short stay cycle parking facilities will be required to ensure they are visually attractive and have the appropriate security measures. Motorcycle parking will be provided at the existing parking cage located at the rear of the Houldsworth Building. Details of how this is to be upgraded to ensure security and meet the needs of any additional bikes are required.

6. Full details of all excrescences on the roof or sides of the building (including lighting, vents, external plant, gas bottle stores, brise soleill etc) will be required to ensure the finished building has clean facades and a roof with as little exposed plant machinery as possible.

15. A requirement of the Travel Plan is that shower facilities are available in the building for the primary benefit of cyclist, this condition will ensure these are provided.